

# Culture and Society in Medieval Galicia

*A Cultural Crossroads at the Edge of Europe*

*Edited and Translated by*

James D'Emilio



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

# Contents

Preface	IX
Acknowledgments	XXIV
List of Figures, Maps, and Tables	XXVI
Abbreviations	XXXII
List of Contributors	XXXVIII

## **PART 1: THE PARADOX OF GALICIA** *A Cultural Crossroads at the Edge of Europe*

- 1 The Paradox of Galicia  
*A Cultural Crossroads at the Edge of Europe* 3  
*James D'Emilio*

## **PART 2: THE SUEVIC KINGDOM** *Between Roman Gallaecia and Modern Myth*

- Introduction to Part 2 126
- 2 The Suevi in Gallaecia  
*An Introduction* 131  
*Michael Kulikowski*
  - 3 Gallaecia in Late Antiquity  
*The Suevic Kingdom and the Rise of Local Powers* 146  
*P. C. Díaz and Luis R. Menéndez-Bueyes*
  - 4 The Suevic Kingdom  
*Why Gallaecia?* 176  
*Fernando López Sánchez*
  - 5 The Church in the Suevic Kingdom (411–585 AD) 210  
*Purificación Ubric*

**PART 3: EARLY MEDIEVAL GALICIA***Tradition and Change*

Introduction to Part 3 246

- 6 The Aristocracy and the Monarchy in Northwest Iberia between the Eighth and the Eleventh Century 251

*Amancio Isla*

- 7 The Charter of Theodenandus

*Writing, Ecclesiastical Culture, and Monastic Reform in Tenth-Century Galicia* 281

*James D'Emilio*

- 8 From Galicia to the Rhône

*Legal Practice in Northern Spain around the Year 1000* 343

*Jeffrey A. Bowman*

**PART 4: GALICIA IN THE IBERIAN KINGDOMS***From Center to Periphery?*

Introduction to Part 4 362

- 9 The Making of Galicia in Feudal Spain (1065–1157) 367

*Ermelindo Portela*

- 10 Galicia and the Galicians in the Latin Chronicles of the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries 400

*Emma Falque*

- 11 The Kingdom of Galicia and the Monarchy of Castile-León in the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries 429

*Francisco Javier Pérez Rodríguez*

**PART 5: COMPOSTELA, GALICIA, AND EUROPE**  
*Galician Culture in the Age of the Pilgrimage*

- Introduction to Part 5 464
- 12 **St. James in Galicia (c. 500–1300)**  
*Rivalries in Heaven and on Earth* 477  
 Thomas Deswarte
- 13 **Compostela**  
*A Cultural Center from the Tenth to the Twelfth Century* 512  
 Adeline Rucquoi
- 14 **The Tomb of St. James**  
*Coming to Terms with History and Tradition* 543  
 John Williams †
- 15 **The European Architecture of Church Reform in Galicia**  
*The Romanesque Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela* 573  
 Henrik Karge
- 16 **The Topography of Images in Santiago Cathedral**  
*Monks, Pilgrims, Bishops, and the Road to Paradise* 631  
 Manuel Castiñeiras
- 17 **Dreams of Kings and Buildings**  
*Visual and Literary Culture in Galicia (1157–1230)* 695  
 Rocío Sánchez Ameijeiras
- 18 **Cistercian Scriptoria in the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries**  
*A Starting Point* 765  
 Ana Suárez González
- 19 **A Convent for *La Sabia***  
*Violante of Aragón and the Clarisas of Allariz* 812  
 Melissa R. Katz

**PART 6: LANGUAGE AND LITERARY CULTURE*****From Latin to Galician-Portuguese***

Introduction to Part 6 838

20 Galician Before 1250 843  
*Roger Wright*21 On the Music of Galician-Portuguese Secular Lyric  
*Sources, Genres, Performance* 862  
*William D. Paden*22 Making Poetry, Making Waves  
*The Galician-Portuguese Sea Lyric* 894  
*Amélia P. Hutchinson***PART 7: MODERN GALICIA AND THE MIDDLE AGES*****Castros, Castles, and the Camino de Santiago***

Introduction to Part 7 914

23 Castles vs. Castros  
*The Middle Ages in the Construction of Galician National  
Identity* 917  
*Ramón Villares***PART 8: EPILOGUE*****Future Directions***Epilogue: Future Directions in the Study of Medieval Galicia 949  
*James D'Emilio*

Index 963

## Preface

In a sense, this book began when I first visited Galicia in 1978 in the tumultuous aftermath of the death of the Spanish dictator Francisco Franco. Across Spain, there was a resurgence of regional identities and an awakening to vigorous political, cultural, and intellectual debates. As Spaniards remade their government and society, Spain's ties to Europe were repaired. The pilgrimage to Santiago de Compostela was just starting to reclaim the fame that would make it emblematic of European integration and a shared cultural heritage at the dawn of a new millennium. Within Galicia, a determined drive to preserve, renew, and promote the Galician language spearheaded the movement for political autonomy and cultural revival.

With an undergraduate degree in medieval studies from Reed College, I arrived in Spain thanks to a Thomas J. Watson Fellowship that generously granted me a singular opportunity for travel and unfettered exploratory research on medieval saints' cults and the arts. As a naïve and aspiring student acquainted with a basic bibliography, I found much to discover. I say 'discover' deliberately, for the pioneering spirit and allure of the picturesque so powerful in early twentieth-century North American art historians like Georgiana Goddard King and Arthur Kingsley Porter no doubt informed my responses, even if unconsciously.

What most fascinated me was the astounding array of rural Romanesque churches, often nestled in the loveliest and—for a walker and hitchhiker—most formidable of sites, from the Pyrenees to the Atlantic. As I soon learned, they were largely ignored by all but local enthusiasts like José Pérez Carmona in Burgos, Francisco Vázquez Saco in Lugo, or, most consequential of all, Miguel Ángel García Guinea (*El románico en Palencia*, 1961). Their heroic, if unheralded, efforts had catalogued countless monuments and rescued many from dilapidation and destruction as well as oblivion. Two wonderfully informative handbooks on Asturian Romanesque churches by Emilio Casares and María Cruz Morales (*El románico en Asturias*, 1977–78) gave the first delightful glimmerings of what, a generation later, would blossom into the popular vogue for the Romanesque in Spain, best represented by the Fundación Santa María la Real at Aguilar de Campoo, its *Enciclopedia del Románico*, and the popular association Amigos del Románico. Few visitors, then, would have dared to predict such a harvest from the first steps in rehabilitating the monastery at Aguilar or even the tireless labor and selfless dedication of García Guinea.

Amidst the beauty of this hidden bounty, I chose to study Romanesque churches in Galicia for they insistently posed a series of larger questions, made

more intriguing by the region's aura of remoteness and the spell of Compostela. In time, these questions would steer my own research beyond Romanesque art and ultimately inspire my plans for this interdisciplinary collection. First, there was the matter of marginality. At one time or other, most Hispanists have surely wrestled with the problem of why medieval (or nineteenth- and twentieth-century) Iberia has lurked outside historical narratives and textbook surveys, or been judged exceptional. This dilemma was magnified and given a new twist for a newcomer searching for Galicia in such accounts inside and outside Spain. Over many years, the bemused, if not incredulous, reactions of Spaniards to my decision, as a North American from the Bronx, to zero in on the province of Lugo told their own story. And, if the scant attention to Master Mateo's *Pórtico da Gloria* in the scholarly bibliography—and its omission from surveys—was puzzling enough to a young art historian, the hundreds of rural churches sadly suffered a fate far worse in a discipline grounded in an aesthetic bias to elite cultures and duly consecrated canons. Even as art history tore down its walls in the next generation, some one-time margins became more privileged than others, and architectural decor and rural art were not among them.

Secondly, Galicia's peripheral place, geographically at least, and the implicit definition of the countryside as an internal periphery raised questions of 'influence' that were only beginning to be reconceived as involving an active and dynamic process of reception and cultural appropriation. Earlier notions, with decidedly colonialist overtones, had framed seminal discussions of Christian culture in Spain, for the pilgrimage to Compostela was seen as facilitating the wholesale importation of religious, cultural, and artistic practices. The matter of 'influence' was debated with even more passion by those who assessed the cultural relations among the three religious communities of medieval Iberia and, specifically, the cultures of religious minorities and the sway of hegemonic groups. For an art historian approaching medieval Galicia, the problem invited critical scrutiny from two distinct, if interrelated, perspectives. Here was a region, at Europe's edge, which boasted a great pilgrimage shrine at Compostela, as well as nearly a dozen Cistercian abbeys, members of the international congregation of the leading religious movement of the twelfth century. Monuments at these sites were reasonably seen as examples of a largely foreign art and architecture, but what did they owe to local traditions and practices? How did foreign clerics and artists respond to the local culture? And, how did local patrons and artists creatively select, alter, and adapt foreign elements for their own ends? Parallel questions arose within Galicia about exchanges between the many hundreds of churches of the countryside and those privileged sites—whether cathedrals or mighty abbeys—whose patrons

and clergy participated directly in the far-flung networks of medieval Christendom.

Thirdly, Galicia's culture was routinely cast as conservative, archaic, or altogether timeless. My favorite example was the dismissal of its rural Romanesque churches, in Spanish and even Galician surveys, as charming remnants of an 'art of inertia', an odd way, it seemed to me, to characterize the Herculean labors behind the carpeting of that fearsome terrain with a thousand robust buildings of precisely cut granite. Such labels stemmed partly from static visions of rural culture and villagers across the globe as 'peoples without history', and, more specifically, from retrospective projections of Galicia's perceived political and economic position within the modern Spanish state. Paradoxically, they were reinforced by nationalist intellectuals who strove to construct a distinctive national identity from essential ethnic and cultural traits rooted in the most distant, indeed prehistoric, past. Disentangling Galicia's medieval history from these modern agendas invited excavation of the political, social, and ideological motives that fueled the writing of history in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries. Today, medievalists across disciplines—like other historians of culture and society—are keenly aware of this dialogue between the present and past. Medievalism thrives as a vibrant area of study and we appreciate how the 'many' Middle Ages, from the *Monumenta Germaniae Historica* to Monty Python and modern Camelots, have been shaped by, for example, nationalism and colonialism, confessional stances and social movements, or the origins and professional formation of prominent academics and the social roles of their institutions. In short, we have forged the tools to relieve Galicia's medieval history of the burden of its modern woes, and to be more self-conscious about our own gaze.

With nearly a thousand churches preserving Romanesque remains and several major buildings of different types, Galicia's Romanesque heritage furnished one promising starting point for critical inquiry into these interrelated areas: the consequences of the region's peripheral position, historically and historiographically; its relationships with larger communities; the internal exchanges between central places and the countryside; and the supposed conservatism of local society and culture. These issues, though, were hardly peculiar to the study of Romanesque art. They could also be addressed by delving into the copious medieval charters and cartularies from the archives of the region's religious institutions. As I undertook my dissertation research in the 1980s, Santiago Jiménez Gómez's *Guía para el estudio de la edad media gallega* (1973) supplied a truly indispensable resource with its clear, systematic, and comprehensive census of available documentation. Of course, the texts of these documents illuminate the religious, economic, social, and political life of



medieval Galicia. Just as valuable—if even less exploited—are the insights into writing, literacy, education, and culture that we may cull from their form, language, and material aspects.

The forty years since Franco's death have seen an explosion of scholarship in Spain and a notable strengthening and diversification of international Hispanism. Introducing his magisterial work, *History and the Historians of Medieval Spain* (1993), Peter Linehan already remarked that “as the 1980s advanced publications on Spanish history went out of control.” That flood has anything but abated in the decades since. All regions have added to this relentless surge in academic books, journals, conferences, archaeological reports, and editions of manuscripts and documents, but not all of this work has landed an equally wide audience. For a variety of reasons, which I explore more thoroughly in the prefaces to each part and in my introductory article, “The Paradox of Galicia,” Galicia and Atlantic Iberia still hover at the edge of contemporary Spanish scholarship outside those regions. In addition, modern political boundaries have impeded unified treatment of the common history of medieval Galicia and northern Portugal. This, in turn, has sidelined Atlantic Iberia in international circles more oriented to the Castilian monarchy, Mediterranean Spain, and the contacts and conflicts among Muslims, Jews, and Christians. Nor has avid attention to the long-distance pilgrimage to Compostela and the cosmopolitan art of its Romanesque cathedral typically sparked much curiosity about the land that gave birth to the apostle's cult.

As a result, medieval Galicia and scholarship on the region remain beyond the horizons of an international public, and largely ignored in works of synthesis. By discouraging outsiders from joining in the writing of medieval Galician history, this neglect has inevitably narrowed the comparative, theoretical, and methodological perspectives applied to that heritage. Not surprisingly, some contemporary scholarship on Galicia may seem insular, or engrossed with the vital spadework of local history that a rich patrimony requires. Given the historiographical and modern position of Galicia, this could only deter foreign scholars or other Spaniards from research on the region, or ensure a lonely sojourn for those who undertook the enterprise. This book is designed to be a significant step towards remedying this by offering medievalists, Hispanists, and students of regional cultures and societies a wide-ranging and interdisciplinary set of studies that introduce the history, culture, and society of medieval Galicia from late antiquity through the thirteenth century, as well as recent scholarship on medieval Galicia, to an English-speaking audience.

In planning this book, I had to integrate the choice of participants and guidelines for their articles, the scope of the volume and topics of its sections, and the themes and issues that would unify the work. This was complicated by the

unevenness of the bibliography on Galicia about many subjects of interest to medievalists and Hispanists, and the absence of any general collections in English (or, indeed, other languages), aimed at a diverse audience and treating medieval Galicia or ample portions of its history and culture. Moreover, I suspect there is always a tension in a project of this size between an ideal design and the contingencies that bedevil its realization. I am, of course, the first and foremost of these idiosyncrasies, and, among other things, this preface is intended to lay bare my own biases. As editor and translator of a pioneering interdisciplinary volume, enlisting a large international cast and spanning nearly a millennium, I faced (and frequently underestimated) daunting challenges. From the start, there needed to be some sensible concessions to my own interests and expertise. Trained as an art historian, I have also published on religious institutions and written culture in medieval Galicia and Iberia; I have worked almost exclusively with Latin, not vernacular, sources, 'ending' my research in the late thirteenth century; and I have, over the years, framed the particular vision of Galicia outlined here and developed in my opening article.

An interdisciplinary collection, a long chronological arc, a desire for some comprehensiveness, and a commitment to speak to a diverse audience of medievalists, Hispanists, and students of regional culture: clearly, we would have to accomplish several goals at once, and this guided my recruitment of participants and commissioning of articles. Contributors deliberately represent several nationalities and academic disciplines, junior and senior scholars, lifelong specialists on Galicia, those whose expertise had engaged them with some Galician material, and those willing to venture fresh views from without. Consequently, the articles I requested would vary in length, scope, and aims, though appearing side by side. All include new research, but in different forms. A few authors were invited to contribute focused case studies, but many were asked to survey and synthesize literature on a topic—sometimes revolving around their own sizeable corpus of publications—and integrate new findings and hypotheses into that broad picture. Where the subjects and state of research recommend it, more extensive bibliographies serve as supplementary guides to recent scholarship. After all, studies on many of these topics—and the work of many contributors—have seldom appeared in English and have been published disproportionately by local presses, or in specialized journals and conference proceedings that lack wide distribution in North America or Britain (and, sometimes, even inside Spain). If all parts are not 'new' in the exact sense of being the very first appearance in print of ideas, arguments, and evidence, they are certainly new in the combination of context, format, and, most of all, audience that creates, we believe, a book that exceeds the sum of its parts and leads readers to a still larger trove of sources and scholarship.

The topics of sections, the boundaries of the volume, and the thematic threads are designed to lend coherence to a collection that demanded such heterogeneity. In defining the sections, I decided to cluster articles to a degree, sacrificing some coverage for the advantages of marshaling different perspectives on selected subjects, sources, and monuments. So, the reader will find, for example, four articles on the Suevic kingdom and late antiquity, three that rely heavily on early medieval charters to examine a variety of topics, and four on the Romanesque cathedral of Compostela.

The chronological framework is neither arbitrary nor calculated to upset conventional definitions of the Middle Ages. Michael Kulikowski rightly advises that “Iberian history before the Arab conquests is nowadays firmly attached to ancient, rather than medieval, history,” but I follow my introductory article (Part 1) with the fifth- and sixth-century Suevic kingdom (Part 2) for two reasons. First, that shadowy realm has haunted the modern Galician imagination as a flickering presentiment of Galician distinctiveness and fleeting moment of political independence. Secondly, and as a corrective to this, our authors’ assessments of Gallaecia—as the larger Roman province was called—within the world of the late empire and early Christianity introduce and epitomize the tension, throughout its medieval history and modern historiography, between the peripheral place and particularities of Galicia and its thorough integration into wider cultural, economic, religious, and political networks and communities. Moreover, late antiquity has been an abundantly fertile field of study and synthesis in English-language scholarship over the last generation, one well known to medievalists, and an area of ever-expanding publication and archaeological work in Iberia as exhibited in the volume edited by Kim Bowes and Michael Kulikowski (*Hispania in Late Antiquity*, 2005).

It is appropriate to start by inserting Galician society and culture into that familiar landscape and posing the paradox that a period praised as a paradigm of Galician distinctiveness may instead prove a model for the region’s full participation in a wider world. In fact, Michael Kulikowski’s opening essay on the Sueves introduces three articles that initiate different threads that run throughout the volume. Pablo Díaz and Luis R. Menéndez-Bueyes consider the configuration of the territory and internal organization of Gallaecia. Analyzing the evolution of *castros* and *villae*, the chronicle of Hydatius, and the evidence of the *Parrochiale Suevum* and an unusual concentration of mints, they portray a densely settled region and highly articulated society. This helps explain the region’s weight, dynamism, and cohesion within the early medieval Astur-Leonese kingdom, a topic later addressed with discussions of its aristocracy, monastic culture, and legal practices (Part 3, “Early Medieval Galicia”), and Adeline Rucquoi’s examination of education and literacy (Part 5). The

constitution of Galicia's boundaries returns to the fore when Ermelindo Portela delineates the choices and contingencies that ultimately defined the 'modern' region (Part 4, "Galicia in the Iberian Kingdoms"). Fernando López Sánchez situates the Sueves and their kingdom within the wide-ranging political, economic, and military networks of the Western Empire in late antiquity. Galicia's place in Iberia, among Atlantic peoples, and within Europe, alongside its ties—real and imagined—to the Mediterranean world, is a central focus throughout the collection, culminating, of course, in our extensive treatment of the cult of St. James, the Romanesque cathedral of Santiago, and the Compostelan pilgrimage. Here, the final piece on the Suevic kingdom, Purificación Ubric's study of the church, demonstrates that Gallaecia was fully a part of late antique Christianity, despite its location, and this foreshadows the vigor of the medieval Galician church, the flowering of monasticism, and, ultimately, the success of the apostolic cult (Part 5, "Compostela, Galicia, and Europe").

At the other end of the collection, we conclude with separate forays, in different sections, into the late thirteenth and early fourteenth centuries: Francisco J. Pérez Rodríguez's re-evaluation of Galicia's 'place' in the enlarged kingdom of Castile-León (Part 4), Melissa Katz's unraveling of the mystery of Queen Violante's foundation of the convent of the Poor Clares at Allariz (Part 5), and tantalizing glimpses of Galician-Portuguese lyric poetry in William Paden's exploration of the music of secular song and Amélia Hutchinson's reading of references to the sea as a mirror of the lived experiences of poets and their public (Part 6). I am certainly not suggesting that the Middle Ages ended or lost their interest, in Galicia or anywhere else, round about 1300. Frankly, that boundary partly bows to the limits of my expertise, but there are other sound reasons for concluding a collection—already hefty enough—at that point. First, the history of late medieval Galicia has been dogged by the commonplace of the region's marginalization after the reunification of Castile-León and the kingdom's southward expansion. Here, Pérez Rodríguez persuasively challenges that paradigm, charting paths for further inquiries. For now, though, its grip has dampened study of the later Middle Ages, in contrast with the attention lavished on the earlier heyday of the cult of St. James and pilgrimage to Compostela, amply illustrated here by several articles and their bibliographies. Although documents proliferate in the later Middle Ages, their very numbers have stymied their publication. A historical overview is sorely needed, but this is not the place, and I am not the editor to provide it.

By contrast, Galician-Portuguese literature and specifically lyric poetry (the *cantigas* of various types) may be one area of medieval Galicia, alongside the Compostelan pilgrimage, that is relatively familiar to North American and

British medievalists and Hispanists, particularly if one includes the *Cantigas de Santa Maria* of the Castilian king Alfonso X the Learned whose poems recently elicited a 466-page critical bibliography from Joseph T. Snow (*The Poetry of Alfonso X: An Annotated Critical Bibliography [1278–2010]*, 2012). The flowering of this poetry in the thirteenth and the early fourteenth century straddles the chronological and geographical boundaries of this collection, as illustrated, for instance, by the important corpus of 137 poems by King Dinis of Portugal (1279–1325) and the compilation of the *cancioneiros* or songbooks that likely occurred during or shortly after his reign. Several edited volumes could be dedicated to this literature, and those volumes, for an English-language public, should be written. To expand its treatment here, within an interdisciplinary collection, would have also required comparable coverage for historical developments in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries. Perhaps this book will prod others to take up that task, and to do so in ways that also do justice to the historical setting for this poetry and its relevance to broader questions about Galician history and culture, its place within different Iberian ‘spaces’, and its ties with wider European cultural traditions.

At the very least, it is fitting that we wrap up our discussion of medieval Galicia with three articles on language and literature (Part 6), including Roger Wright’s provocative look at when, how, and why the Galician language came to have “an identifiably discrete existence.” After all, the language has today become a cornerstone of “the definition of Galicia as a nation” through the “‘philologization’ of Galician nationalist discourse,” as Ramón Villares notes in the closing article in the volume (Part 7), where he reflects on the importance of the Middle Ages—alongside or in conflict with Celticism—in the construction of Galician national identity through the works of the nineteenth-century historian Benito Vicetto, the poet Ramón Cabanillas, and the artist Luis Seoane.

Bookended by the Suevic kingdom (Part 2) and the Galician vernacular (Part 6), two pillars of modern Galician constructions of the nation and its medieval past, the rest of the volume centers on three topics: early medieval Galicia (Part 3), Galicia within the Iberian kingdoms of the central Middle Ages (Part 4), and the cult of St. James and pilgrimage to Compostela (Part 5). My prefaces introduce the articles more specifically and, of course, the authors best speak for themselves, but a few remarks here may explain my choices and the overall orientation of each part.

The weight of Compostela should be no surprise, for it is what put Galicia on the map in the Middle Ages and in whatever nook it occupies in the consciousness of medievalists today. It is undoubtedly true, as Henrik Karge declares, that, next to Galician buildings of its day, the Romanesque cathedral of Santiago “looms like an apparition from an alien world.” Nonetheless, this

architectural revolution did not unfold in a cultural vacuum, as Adeline Rucquoi makes plain with a thorough investigation of education and literacy across early medieval Galicia, and of the wide-ranging intellectual resources of the school of Compostela in the eleventh and twelfth centuries. That school's impressive achievements and the creation of what she terms a "Compostelan 'literature'" arose from "a program of cultural politics" aimed at "defending the interests of the Compostelan see," bolstering the apostolic cult, and creating a "history of Galicia." Thomas Deswarte brings to light the polemical context for these efforts, as he charts the explosive growth of the cult of St. James and the long cultural transformation of the apostle in the face of rivals and discontents within Iberia, and a wary papacy in Rome. For his part, John Williams excavates the murky history of the shrine at the heart of the cult. Reminding us that today's tomb is wholly a fabrication of a modern era anxious to reconcile faith and science, he also shows that archaeological remains and twelfth-century texts give glimpses of how the clergy of medieval Compostela already grappled with the uncertain origins of their own cult.

As Rucquoi and Deswarte demonstrate, Compostela supplies a vantage point from which to look outwards and inwards, and this is exemplified in the treatments of the Romanesque cathedral by Karge, Manuel Castiñeiras, and Rocío Sánchez Ameijeiras. From its commencement in the 1070s to its consecration in 1211, the cathedral's patrons and artists took part in a sophisticated artistic dialogue that goes far beyond simple notions of an 'art of the pilgrimage roads'. Karge explains how Compostela joined a community of buildings and shrines taking shape in southern and western France "amidst intense rivalry among Aquitanian shrines and their apostolic claims." Castiñeiras identifies the fruits of the comings and goings of artists and clergy between Compostela, Aragón, Toulouse, and Conques, but also follows the boundless ambitions of Archbishop Diego Gelmírez and the Compostelan clergy to Rome and Jerusalem, and discovers a remarkable ekphrasis of the Pórtico da Gloria in the *Vision of Thurkill*, where the soul of an English peasant is spirited to Compostela. By the late twelfth century, as Rocío Sánchez demonstrates, the "distinctive figural language" of artists at Compostela was "a kind of visual polyglossy," nourished by a keen awareness of the latest developments in English manuscript illumination, the late Romanesque art of Burgundy and sites across Iberia, and the new architecture, sculpture, and stained glass of the early Gothic cathedrals of northern France and its neighbors.

Compostela, however, was also part of Galicia, and Galicia was more than Compostela. Even while dubbing the Romanesque cathedral "an alien apparition," Karge perceptively describes how it paid homage to its early medieval predecessors, thereby validating the traditions of the site. Alongside the

manifold international connections that gave life to the iconographic programs of the cathedral, Castiñeiras deciphers imagery tailored to a multitude of local audiences, from the monks of Antealtares to the townspeople struggling with episcopal lordship. Finally, Rocío Sánchez takes us from Compostela's soaring aspirations to become a *civitas regia* to the frontier cathedrals of Ourense and Tui where innovative experiments with architecture and sculpture promoted local cults, commented on the monarchy, blended monastic spirituality with snippets of scholastic culture, and wove together "profane and sacred discourses" in ways that belie any "simplistic and reductionist dichotomy" between courtly and clerical culture.

The Galician cathedrals were not the only sites where international cultural currents and local concerns mixed in the great age of the pilgrimage. Deswarte endorses the role of the monastery of Montesacro in concocting the *Epistola Leonis*, a crucial text on the translation of St. James's remains, while Rucquoi finds "precious evidence of the high level of learning across Galicia," particularly in the monastic milieu, in the *mapa mundi* at San Pedro de Rocas and the dossier fashioned at Celanova in the late twelfth century for the canonization of its founder, St. Rosendo. The last two articles in this section turn to the international religious orders and their patrons who also fostered dynamic exchanges within Galicia and with the world outside. Ana Suárez painstakingly reconstructs the personnel, talents, and output of Cistercian scriptoria in Galicia during a pivotal period when the order flourished there and writing styles were in flux. Until now, the dearth of known manuscripts has reduced Cistercian Galicia to "a bibliographic wasteland," masking the necessary importance of scriptoria among Cistercian communities where books were "indispensable to the liturgy and education" and writing was an essential tool in the growth, administration, and defense of monastic estates. Melissa Katz ties Queen Violante's foundation of a convent of Poor Clares at Allariz to the bitter struggles between the Franciscans and the episcopacy, providing an example of how the mendicants and the monarchy kept Galicia on the map in the years when its importance supposedly waned.

In different ways, several of these studies of Compostela and Galicia in the central Middle Ages look back to early medieval traditions, but the great age of the pilgrimage is still often heralded as 'opening' Christian Spain to Europe through a decisive break with centuries of isolation and impoverishment. Dedicating a section (Part 3) to Galicia from the eighth to the eleventh century was designed to counter that view, to enrich conventional treatments of the Astur-Leonese kingdom in English-language scholarship, and to invite readers to include Galicia in their visions of early medieval Europe. Amancio Isla opens by examining the collaborative and conflictive relationships between

the regional aristocracy of the Northwest and the kings of Oviedo and León. I analyze the charter of Theodenandus, a document of 902 that casts light on the court culture of Alfonso III, the crises and reforms of Galician monasticism in the tenth century, and, specifically, the restoration of what would one day become the great Benedictine house of Samos. Jeffrey Bowman compares legal practices and the resolution of disputes in tenth- and early eleventh-century Galicia and Catalonia, arguing that such comparisons can isolate distinctive regional characteristics and call into question the linkages among diverse phenomena in broad historical paradigms.

All three authors recognize the legacy of late antique Gallaecia and Visigothic rule, and all three studies illustrate the value of early medieval Galician charters for today's historians, and the complexity of the society and culture which produced them. Together, they attest to the weight of Galicia in the Astur-Leonese kingdom. More than a vindication of one region, this urges a shift away from the narrowly political and military history of the monarchy, frontier, and so-called 'Reconquest' that has dominated the limited treatment of the kingdom in English-language scholarship. The richness and relevance of early medieval Galician society and culture suggest that we amplify Bowman's appeal for comparative history, even looking beyond the territories "from the Rhône to Galicia" to reconsider paradigms based on Carolingian Europe, and to embrace other lands on its periphery from the British Isles to southern Italy. With deep roots in the religious and legal heritage of late antiquity and the political and social structures shaped by Rome and its successor states, early medieval Galicia can deepen our understanding of the transition from antiquity to the Middle Ages, and the establishment of basic patterns of medieval society and culture.

If this trio of articles implicitly proposes a re-evaluation of Galicia's role in the Astur-Leonese kingdom, those in the next section (Part 4) directly confront Galicia's changing position among the Iberian kingdoms of the central Middle Ages, and the consolidation in the thirteenth century—at least by conventional narratives—of the peripheral position it occupied thereafter. Of course, they provide a political framework for the cultural world of Compostela in its golden age, but they also address an issue which has absorbed Galician nationalists and left its imprint on Galician historiography: the definition of the territory of modern Galicia, its separation from Portugal, and its place in the realms that gave rise to the modern Spanish state.

Ermelindo Portela opens by examining how the boundaries of "the Galicia of the future" were fixed in the century between the threefold partition of the kingdom of Fernando I in 1065 and the division of Castile and León, alongside an independent Portugal, at the death of Alfonso VII in 1157. The larger



territory of Roman Gallaecia was finally sundered, a smaller Galicia was cut off from the advancing frontier of the Christian kingdoms, and key social groups hitched their fortunes to the Leonese monarchy. Francisco J. Pérez Rodríguez considers Galicia within the kingdom of Fernando III (1230–1252) and Alfonso X (1252–1284) after the reunification of Castile-León and the conquests in Andalusia. Focusing upon royal policies and highlighting continuities with those of earlier Leonese kings, Pérez Rodríguez sets aside the dreary dirge for a Galicia marginalized and abandoned, stumbling into an irreversible decline under the smothering weight of ecclesiastical lords. Instead, he invites a new appreciation of the dynamism of royal administration and late medieval Galician society, the region's ongoing role in peninsular politics, and its capacity for change. Emma Falque surveys Galicia's place in the twelfth- and thirteenth-century chronicles of the kingdoms of León and Castile. With decidedly political agendas, the sharply contrasting perspectives of these histories are an ideological complement to the evolving role of Galicia and the Galicians within the kingdoms.

The Suevic kingdom and late antique Gallaecia, Galician society and culture within the Astur-Leonese kingdom, the shifting place of Galicia among the Iberian kingdoms of the central Middle Ages, the cosmopolitan culture of Galicia in the great age of the pilgrimage, and the emergence of the Galician language and vernacular literature: these are the topics with which we have chosen to introduce medieval Galicia.

This preface has retraced my own path to this volume, and the issues that I have found compelling about medieval Galicia and sought to develop through this collective project. The authors, of course, speak with their own voices, and are not meant to be strait-jacketed by my designs or preoccupations. And, I hope and expect that you, the reader, will bring your own perspectives to this collection, finding relevance to your own fields in ways that may eventually lead you to enlarge and enrich the study of medieval Galicia with your own insights.

### **Note on Format and Style**

The twenty-three articles in this collection range across disciplines and span a thousand years of Galician history. Their authors are from Galicia, different regions of Spain, and five other countries. Editing these articles and translating the majority of them was intellectually rewarding at every stage. One of the most daunting tasks, however, was the utterly mundane one of establishing a reasonable consistency of editorial practice, while respecting the diversity

these articles represent. Understandably, readers (and the authors themselves) may wonder about some of my decisions, so I outline here some principles that guided my choices about style, notes and bibliography, foreign language terms and quotations, and indexing.

I have followed *The Chicago Manual of Style, Sixteenth Edition* for basic editorial matters (punctuation, hyphenation, capitalization, italicization, citations...) with some adaptations to alternative practices in recent Brill volumes on related subjects and to the exigencies of this collection. These articles necessarily abound in foreign terms, so I have used italics sparingly. Foreign words and phrases familiar in English (e.g., *de facto*, *ex nihilo*, *ibid.*, *in situ*, *mentalités*, *scriptorium*...) are not italicized, and foreign terms used regularly within an article (e.g., *cancioneiros*, *cantigas*, *castros*, *conuentus*...) are italicized only at their first appearances. Foreign quotations are italicized except in block quotes; foreign proper names (Arca Santa, Bracara Augusta, Camino de Santiago, Día de Galicia, Gallaecia, Puerta de Platerías, Seminario de Estudos Galegos...) generally are not except for specific titles of literary works and manuscripts (*Cantares gallegos*, *Chronicon mundi*, *Codex Calixtinus*, *Tumbo A...*). For capitalization, I have followed Chicago's preference for a 'down' style, limiting my use of capitals (church, late antiquity, Cistercian order, Gregorian reform, Roman rite...) and, in particular, using 'sentence-style' capitalization for foreign titles of works, including congresses, in all bibliographies, except for the names of journals which I have distinguished with 'headline-style' capitalization throughout.

In a volume of this scope and diversity, the language and spelling of names of persons and places present their own problems and defy consistency. For personal names, I have used commonly accepted English ones (e.g., Jerome, Augustine, Gregory of Tours, John of Bictar, Isidore of Seville...) where they enjoy currency. Generally speaking, however, I opted for Latin or Germanic forms through the eighth century (Orosius, Theoderic, Hydatius, Rechiar, Fructuosus, Valerius of Bierzo...), and Spanish afterwards for relatively well-known figures in Galician history (Hermenegildo Gutiérrez, Sisnando Davidiz, Dalmacio, Fernando Pérez de Traba...). I have bent that chronological boundary for the sake of consistency within what I perceive to be categories: the Latin 'Beatus of Liébana' groups the eighth-century monastic author with the religious writers of late antiquity and Visigothic times; the Spanish 'Odoario' or 'Mauregato' joins the eighth-century bishop of Lugo or the king of Oviedo to their successors. I have also retained Latin names for lesser-known early Christian saints (Torquatus, Indalecius, Caprasius, Saturninus...) even though they are typically mentioned retrospectively in references to their medieval cults. When authors mention individuals known only through the cited

documents, I have kept the forms (typically Latin) found within those texts, unless there are unambiguous and commonly used Romance equivalents (Ramirus/Ramiro, Alvarus/Álvaro, Petri/Pérez...). Respect for the original Latin, however, is generalized in those contexts—and throughout the article of Ana Suárez on Cistercian scriptoria—where the language and authors of Latin documents are the very subjects of study. Finally, I have respected authors' decisions in rendering the names of Galician-Portuguese poets with orthography that may be closer to modern Spanish, Galician, or Portuguese. Minor variations are cross-referenced in the index.

For place names, context and authorial preferences have determined the primary use of Latin or a modern form for ancient sites, but the alternate toponym is often added parenthetically for clarity. The difference between Galician and Castilian ('Spanish'), however, is the main conundrum in the minefield of toponymy. In general, I have adopted Galician for Galician places (A Coruña, Ourense, Tui...) that recur throughout the volume. Here, too, there are exceptions. Interestingly, all authors—myself excluded—chose the Spanish 'Pórtico de la Gloria' over the Galician 'Pórtico da Gloria', and I have let that stand. The chronicler Lucas of Tuy is well known by that sobriquet: to change it to 'Tui' would be otiose. For sites named in but an article or two, I have preferred Galician (Lourenzá, Oseira, Penamaior...), but authors' choices of Spanish forms have sometimes prevailed, notably for Galician places closely linked with studies or editions published in Spanish (Jubía/Xubía), or for saints' names (Santa Eulalia/Santalla, Santa Baia, or Santa Olaia...) where designations in Galician nomenclature and gazetteers vary wildly and change frequently. Beyond the banalities of stylistic niceties, the elusiveness of a standard orthography for local toponyms in a land of dispersed communities and complex topography exemplifies the ongoing struggle between a regional identity defined in elite centers and the dynamic and multifaceted localism arising from Galician geography and settlement.

In an effort to make the volume as broadly accessible as possible, I have ensured that lengthy quotations from sources (mainly Latin) in the body of the articles are translated into English or at least paraphrased or summarized. This does not extend to footnotes where Latin quotations serve as supplementary documentation. There are also exceptions in articles (my own on Theodenandus, that of Suárez on Cistercian scriptoria, and those of Wright, Paden, and Hutchinson on Galician language and literature) where the form and language of texts are the matter of discussion, and an overabundance of translations would add unnecessary length.

Because of the diversity of fields and disciplines represented here, each article has its own bibliography of works cited. Any abbreviations are normally

indicated in these bibliographies, although I have also assembled an overall list of abbreviations. I am responsible for dividing the bibliographies into 'primary' and 'secondary' sources, and for eliminating references to most series within bibliographic entries. In footnotes, secondary sources are cited in abbreviated form by author, year, and page number. Because these 'abbreviated' references are keyed to individual bibliographies, I have regularly shortened the citation of Spanish authors to include only the first of two surnames, except where the first is a common one (Pérez, García, González...) or where I judged authors to be well known by their pair of surnames. This decision—necessarily subjective—was nothing more than my pragmatic response to the length of the volume and my desire to compress it where possible without loss of content. Primary sources are typically cited by abbreviated titles, fully explained in the bibliographies, and by the editorial divisions of their text (books, chapters, paragraphs...) accompanied by page numbers. For the most part, I have respected authors' choices among multiple—and sometimes competing—editions and translations of several works: three of Egeria's account of her pilgrimage to the Holy Land, four of the *Historia Compostellana*, four of the *Liber Sancti Jacobi* (plus at least four more of *The Pilgrim's Guide* within it), two—though identical—of the *Tumbo A* of Santiago, and two—inciting particularly harsh polemic in their day—of most documents in the *Tombo de Celanova*. For the *Tumbos de Sobrado* and *Tumbo de Samos* respectively, Ana Suárez and I have verified our quotations directly from the manuscripts, as explained in our articles, due to certain deficiencies in the published editions.

Finally, the index is comprehensive, encompassing proper names of persons and places, as well as concepts, themes, and topics of importance. Modern historians and other authors of secondary literature are indexed when their interpretations are themselves a matter of debate and historiographical discussion within the articles.