# Table of Contents

## Articles

Margaret Goehring. Signs of the City: Seigniorial Power and Vernacular Visual Culture in Two Northern French Rent-Books 1

Mati Meyer. The Rhetoric of Aphrodite in the Byzantine Illuminated Book 30

Justin Willson. Reading with the Evangelists: Portrait, Gesture, and Interpretation in the Byzantine Gospel Book 67

David M. Freidenreich and Véronique Plesch. “What is That to Us?”: The Eucharistic Liturgy and the Enemies of Christ in the Beam of the Passion 104

Renana Bartal. Text, Textile, Blood: Mary under the Cross in an Illuminated *Meditationes Vitae Christi* (Oxford, Corpus Christi College, MS 410) 131

Louise Marshall. St. Roch and the Angel in Renaissance Art 165

## Reviews


   By Karen Lang 222

Rachel Moss, Felicity O’Mahony and Jane Maxwell, eds. An Insular Odyssey: Manuscript Culture in Early Christian Ireland and Beyond.
   By Carol Neuman de Vegvar 225

Renana Bartal. Gender, Piety, and Production in Fourteenth-Century English Apocalypse Manuscripts; and
   By Alexa Sand 229

Jeffrey F. Hamburger, Robert Suckale, and Gude Suckale-Redlefsen, eds. Painting the Page in the Age of Print.
   By Larry Silver and Debra Cashion 235

   By Nancy L. Wicker 241

Notes on Contributors 245
NOTES

4 Camille, Image on the Edge, 63–64.
8 Ibid., 93–121.


Pp. 229; 16 color illus., 20 black-and-white illus.

Diane J. Reilly has written a careful, thorough, and thought-provoking exploration of relationships between the earliest manuscripts and liturgy at Cîteaux. She examines how new images and meanings emerged within the shared culture of Benedictine monasticism, and she marshals persuasive evidence for the monks' meditations on the sensory experience of Scripture and the nature of their new community.

Reilly restores the first generation of monks, scribes, and artists at Cîteaux to their rightful place in Cistercian history, assessing, for example, their impact on St. Bernard's writings on the Virgin Mary. Beyond this, her inquiries address the crucial role of liturgical performance and communal reading in shaping the monks' understanding of Scripture and their creation and reception of imagery. Methodologically, Reilly's candid and refreshingly cautious observations on the limits and ambiguities of interpretation invite historians of images and ideas to reflect on the challenges
posed by multivalent texts and images grounded in commonplaces of monastic liturgy and scriptural exegesis.

In an ample introduction, Reilly clearly describes her methodology and the historiographical context for her effort “to identify tangible links between what was heard at Cîteaux, what was painted, and how the earliest Cistercian monks thought about communal reading and singing” (34). Placing communal hearing at the core of scriptural learning, she argues that the early manuscripts are “replete with images that both echo the lections and chants they heard communally, and affirm the importance of hearing, speaking, and ingesting the word” (16). She demonstrates this in four chapters that treat different images and manuscripts, illuminate these key concerns of the early monks, and tackle methodological problems surrounding relationships among images, texts, and liturgical performance.

Her first chapter (“The Joy of Psalmody”) introduces recurring themes by zeroing in on the Advent Night Office at Cîteaux. Making use of Margot Fassler’s study of art and liturgy at Chartres,1 Reilly compares the two Offices, explains distinctive texts or pairings of texts at Cîteaux, and suggests relationships with imagery in manuscripts produced there. Within a largely traditional liturgy, she contends, the choice and combination of chants and lections, and even the selective use of melismatic flourishes, “foregrounded the theme of spoken and sung words” (39) and lent special weight to “the leitmotiv of sounding and listening” (53).

At Cîteaux, the Advent Night Office featured passages from Jerome’s prologues in which he commented on his task as editor and translator of the Vulgate. In chapter 2 (“Jerome’s Legacy at Twelfth-Century Cîteaux”), Reilly argues that the monks identified their own editorial projects, bookmaking, and liturgical reforms with his work. She convincingly establishes the shared interest of editors, liturgists, and artists in “elevating Jerome to the rank of a divinely-inspired author, like an evangelist” (74). She cites the unusual prominence of his prologues throughout the liturgical year and the number and nature of his portraits in early manuscripts. Carefully analyzing a Cîteaux collection of Jerome’s Letters and Sermons (Dijon, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 135), she shows how the illuminated initials, three-column arrangement, and apparatus for oral reading likened his text to Scripture, while underlining the relevance of his work to the monks’ own enterprise.

Reilly’s exposition of the historiated initials of Jerome’s Letters and their complex, allusive relationship to accompanying texts is especially insightful and illuminating. Overall, this is her most definitive chapter in its argument and conclusions: distinctive elements of the new community’s liturgy, texts, and images consistently combine and reinforce one another to affirm Jerome’s importance as a model at Cîteaux under Abbots Alberic and, particularly, Stephen Harding. In her two final chapters, by contrast, she must tease out novel interpretations and emphases against a backdrop of more commonplace texts and images without the programmatic clarity of this single-minded presentation of Jerome.

In chapter 3 (“The Virgin and the Abbot”), Reilly turns to Marian iconography, focusing on images of the Tree of Jesse in two early lectern-sized Cîteaux manuscripts: Jerome’s Commentary on Isaiah (Dijon BM, MS 129) and a sanctoral lectionary (Dijon BM, MS 641). Both are unusual for what they omit, introduce, or combine. Reilly discusses the appearance of Trinitarian imagery, the nursing Virgin, sacramental allusions to Christ’s priesthood, and typological prefigurations of Christ, as well as the absence of royal regalia and the ancestors and prophets familiar from liturgical drama. She compares diverse visual precedents and proposes suggestive sources in the Cîteaux liturgy which often override the accompanying texts. In addition, she finds echoes of images and liturgy in St. Bernard’s early sermons on the Virgin (the Magnificat). Nonetheless, she reasonably concedes...
(e.g., 107, 128, 139) the difficulties in isolating one specific pathway to these novel images through chants, lections, or commentaries, since all draw upon well-established, widely shared, and interconnected interpretations of Isaiah’s prophecy, the Virgin’s role, and the advent of Jesus.

In chapter 4 (“Fruitful Words in the Stephen Harding Bible”), Reilly demonstrates how an artist in the Stephen Harding Bible “explored several different means of representing both the ways that Scripture was spoken, sung, and savoured, and the way that the spoken Word of God worked in the world” (143). Her discussion of Marian iconography grapples with the limits of our understanding of how and why selected texts from a large liturgical and exegetical corpus contributed to the creation of images. Here, she confronts “the ubiquity of the digested word topos in exegetical writing” (143) and of nibbling beasts in manuscript imagery.

Reilly focuses on historiated initials in the second volume of the Bible (Dijon BM, MSS 14, 15) painted by the primary illuminator of the Citeaux Moralia in Job (Dijon BM, MSS 168, 169, 170, 173). Conrad Rudolph argued that this painter creatively designed his initials as an exposition of specific texts, developing the theme of spiritual struggle and relating daily monastic life to Gregory’s admonitions. Reilly urges a more flexible view of this artist’s inventiveness, suggesting additional meanings for his illuminations in the Moralia and proposing that he embarked on a new program in the Bible. There, he reflected on the spoken word and moralized the parallels between food and Scripture, ideas reinforced by communal reading in the refectory. Reilly’s explications of the scene of Herod’s suicide and of a figure commonly seen as Arius are persuasive, well-developed examples.

In short, Reilly offers a valuable and suggestive book for historians of medieval art and students of monasticism, manuscripts, and the relationships between images, texts, liturgy, and scriptural reading. Even specialists on manuscripts and liturgy will be impressed by her keen eye for signs of use, emphasis, correction, and interpretation in existing manuscripts and her easy command of the complex reconstruction of the earliest liturgy at Citeaux from later manuscripts and fragments, the web of intertextual relations across the yearly liturgy, the dialogue between biblical and liturgical texts, and the links between chant and readings at Citeaux and other houses.

My only quibble is that less specialized readers would have benefited from a fuller conclusion, recapitulating and tying together main threads in a densely argued work. That might also have addressed more explicitly and systematically the methodological challenges Reilly acknowledges in interpreting multivalent images against the vast range of texts and experience that contributed to how artists created them and how readers understood them. In this respect, her case study has wide-ranging implications. Lastly, one minor editorial note: the superb quality of color plate 8 (the Isaiah initial) makes one wish that the generous set of color plates had included more details and fewer full-page reproductions for which black and white may have been adequate.

James D’Emilio
University of South Florida

NOTES