

Culture and Society in Medieval Galicia

A Cultural Crossroads at the Edge of Europe

Edited and Translated by

James D'Emilio



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Contents

Preface	IX
Acknowledgments	XXIV
List of Figures, Maps, and Tables	XXVI
Abbreviations	XXXII
List of Contributors	XXXVIII

PART 1: THE PARADOX OF GALICIA *A Cultural Crossroads at the Edge of Europe*

- 1 The Paradox of Galicia**
A Cultural Crossroads at the Edge of Europe 3
James D'Emilio

PART 2: THE SUEVIC KINGDOM *Between Roman Gallaecia and Modern Myth*

- Introduction to Part 2 126
- 2 The Suevi in Gallaecia**
An Introduction 131
Michael Kulikowski
 - 3 Gallaecia in Late Antiquity**
The Suevic Kingdom and the Rise of Local Powers 146
P. C. Díaz and Luis R. Menéndez-Bueyes
 - 4 The Suevic Kingdom**
Why Gallaecia? 176
Fernando López Sánchez
 - 5 The Church in the Suevic Kingdom (411–585 AD)** 210
Purificación Ubric

PART 3: EARLY MEDIEVAL GALICIA*Tradition and Change*

Introduction to Part 3 246

- 6 The Aristocracy and the Monarchy in Northwest Iberia between the Eighth and the Eleventh Century 251

Amancio Isla

- 7 The Charter of Theodenandus

Writing, Ecclesiastical Culture, and Monastic Reform in Tenth-Century Galicia 281

James D'Emilio

- 8 From Galicia to the Rhône

Legal Practice in Northern Spain around the Year 1000 343

Jeffrey A. Bowman

PART 4: GALICIA IN THE IBERIAN KINGDOMS*From Center to Periphery?*

Introduction to Part 4 362

- 9 The Making of Galicia in Feudal Spain (1065–1157) 367

Ermelindo Portela

- 10 Galicia and the Galicians in the Latin Chronicles of the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries 400

Emma Falque

- 11 The Kingdom of Galicia and the Monarchy of Castile-León in the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries 429

Francisco Javier Pérez Rodríguez

PART 5: COMPOSTELA, GALICIA, AND EUROPE
Galician Culture in the Age of the Pilgrimage

- Introduction to Part 5 464
- 12 **St. James in Galicia (c. 500–1300)**
Rivalries in Heaven and on Earth 477
 Thomas Deswarte
- 13 **Compostela**
A Cultural Center from the Tenth to the Twelfth Century 512
 Adeline Rucquoi
- 14 **The Tomb of St. James**
Coming to Terms with History and Tradition 543
 John Williams †
- 15 **The European Architecture of Church Reform in Galicia**
The Romanesque Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela 573
 Henrik Karge
- 16 **The Topography of Images in Santiago Cathedral**
Monks, Pilgrims, Bishops, and the Road to Paradise 631
 Manuel Castiñeiras
- 17 **Dreams of Kings and Buildings**
Visual and Literary Culture in Galicia (1157–1230) 695
 Rocío Sánchez Ameijeiras
- 18 **Cistercian Scriptoria in the Twelfth and Thirteenth Centuries**
A Starting Point 765
 Ana Suárez González
- 19 **A Convent for *La Sabia***
Violante of Aragón and the Clarisas of Allariz 812
 Melissa R. Katz

PART 6: LANGUAGE AND LITERARY CULTURE***From Latin to Galician-Portuguese***

Introduction to Part 6 838

20 Galician Before 1250 843
*Roger Wright*21 On the Music of Galician-Portuguese Secular Lyric
Sources, Genres, Performance 862
*William D. Paden*22 Making Poetry, Making Waves
The Galician-Portuguese Sea Lyric 894
*Amélia P. Hutchinson***PART 7: MODERN GALICIA AND THE MIDDLE AGES*****Castros, Castles, and the Camino de Santiago***

Introduction to Part 7 914

23 Castles vs. Castros
*The Middle Ages in the Construction of Galician National
Identity* 917
*Ramón Villares***PART 8: EPILOGUE*****Future Directions***Epilogue: Future Directions in the Study of Medieval Galicia 949
James D'Emilio

Index 963

Compostela, Galicia, and Europe

Galician Culture in the Age of the Pilgrimage

James D'Emilio

We center this—the largest—section on Compostela. It was, after all, the pilgrimage to the apostle's shrine that restored and reinvigorated Galicia's links to Europe, the Mediterranean, and the northern seas. More than any other cultural phenomenon or political process, St. James's cult not only overcame Galicia's remoteness, but, through the long-distance pilgrimage, made it the basis for a privileged place within medieval Christendom. Our authors highlight the multifaceted international connections of the cult and its expression in art, literature, and devotion, and they introduce other links between Galicia and larger communities in the 'golden age' of the pilgrimage, as exemplified by the houses of the international religious orders.

We begin with two articles in which Thomas Deswarte and Adeline Rucquoi explore the intellectual and cultural underpinnings of the cult of St. James and chart its growth and transformation from the seventh to the thirteenth century. Then, John Williams places the cult within its architectural setting by unearthing the history of the apostle's tomb—the root of the cult—from medieval texts and modern excavations. In three articles, Henrik Karge, Manuel Castiñeiras, and Rocío Sánchez Ameijeiras examine the Romanesque cathedral of Santiago in its international context, from its architecture to the sophisticated iconography of its sculptural programs, capped by Master Mateo's Pórtico da Gloria—the late twelfth-century west porch—and its crypt, gallery, and monumental façade. By relating the art of the cathedrals of Ourense and Tui to the Pórtico, Sánchez opens a broader Galician landscape. The final articles turn to the religious orders and their patrons. Ana Suárez González reconstructs the Cistercian scriptoria of Galicia and Melissa Katz explains Queen Violante's foundation of a convent of Poor Clares at Allariz from the perspective of women's patronage and the violent struggle between the mendicants and the bishops of Ourense.

In my preface to this book, I commented on key threads in this section: the cosmopolitanism of Compostela in the age of the pilgrimage, its debt to local traditions, and the flowering of an international culture across Galicia. The pilgrimage and apostolic cult drove Galicia's engagement with a wider world in the central Middle Ages, and the art of the cathedral and literature of the cult gave form to Compostela's cosmopolitan aspirations. At the same time, this was a homegrown devotion. The topography of the shrine and the tangle of legend that carried St. James to Compostela took shape in early medieval

Galicia where, as we have seen, religious culture thrived on a bountiful heritage of law, education, and monastic practice originating in late antiquity. By the central Middle Ages, the cosmopolitan culture which crystallized at Compostela resonated across the region, while members of different sectors of Galician society—from the cathedral clergy and religious orders to nobles, knights, and craftsmen—cultivated their own relationships to lands within and beyond the Iberian Peninsula.

The cult of St. James in its varied manifestations is likely to be the most familiar aspect of medieval Galicia for English-speaking readers, whether through general works, academic studies of the pilgrimage and Romanesque art, or the popular appeal of the Camino de Santiago. In my introductory article, “The Paradox of Galicia,” I reflected on the paradoxical centrality which Compostela conferred on Galicia. To introduce this ample section, it makes sense to pick out distinctive aspects of the cult and shrine and findings that counter prevailing assumptions. For the cathedral, which four art historians treat in detail, I will comment as well on some prominent questions in its historiography from the overall perspective of the volume.

The medieval cult of St. James at Compostela rests upon the legendary translation of his remains to Galicia. It was an unusual devotion in several respects. Obviously, James was not a local saint. Nor did his life or legend bind him to Galicia before his death. Unlike other shrines that acquired ‘foreign’ relics, by whatever means, long after a saint’s death, Compostela did claim that the miraculous arrival was engineered soon after James’s martyrdom in Jerusalem. Any efforts, however, to credit the apostle with evangelizing Galicia or Spain made little headway and were largely abandoned, as Thomas Deswarte contends, before the implacable opposition of the papacy and other rivals. Indeed, as Katherine van Liere has shown (“The Moorslayer and the Missionary,” *Viator* 37 [2006]: 519–543), Renaissance humanists and religious writers of the Enlightenment resurrected the belief that James had evangelized Spain, and, in doing so, obscured the quite different view of the apostle that held sway in the Middle Ages.

That remaking of James during the worldwide expansion of Spain’s Catholic empire marks but one of many new faces the apostle assumed as his cult grew. Deswarte relates his medieval transformations to changing historical circumstances and rival devotions. Certainly, two of the apostle’s most enduring roles—as Matamoros or Moorslayer, and as a saint in the guise of his own pilgrims—could be understood as surrogates for the evangelizing mission the medieval cult denied the saint. Whether as militant champion in an age of Christian conquest or devout pilgrim journeying to a distant shrine, St. James pushed the frontiers of Christendom to the ends of the earth in a twelfth-century rewriting of apostolic ideals.

Given that the divinely ordained burial place of St. James was what justified the medieval cult, it is remarkable, as John Williams explains, that the great Romanesque church largely erased the tomb, made it inaccessible, and wrapped its earlier forms in mystery forever after. Here, too, we must set aside modern inventions, like the late nineteenth-century crypt and silver chest which pious or curious visitors now find. Just as James the pilgrim and Moorslayer rendered irrelevant any shaky assertions of an apostolic mission to Spain, so, too, the splendid Romanesque cathedral replaced whatever tomb there was with images and virtual itineraries that framed the *locus sanctus* within the whole universe of Christian devotion.

The international character of the cathedral and pilgrimage has been a commonplace in scholarship since the late nineteenth-century “discovery”—as Karge terms it—of the Romanesque cathedral. In particular, the building was a flashpoint in the early twentieth-century polemic over the French or Spanish origins of the monumental sculpture that adorned the pilgrimage road, and the road itself was imagined as something of a one-way street bringing, as Émile Mâle put it, “civilization” to Spain, and a civilization with an unmistakably French flavor.

Today, our appreciation of Compostela as a cosmopolitan site is far more nuanced, accommodating more diverse exchanges with cultural and religious centers across Europe, acknowledging the creative energies arising from the cult, and gazing further afield to the great pilgrimage destinations of Rome and the Holy Land. ‘France’ is regularly mentioned when scholars debate the genesis of the architecture and sculpture of the cathedral, or the emperor Charlemagne’s bold entry into the legends of the cult. Adeline Rucquoi, however, exposes the anachronisms implicit in these discussions. In the twelfth-century *Historia Compostellana*, for example, authors distinguished ‘Gallia’, south of the Loire, from ‘Francia’, to the north. Moreover, she questions the outsized role credited to Cluny in popularizing the pilgrimage and shaping texts like those in the *Liber sancti Jacobi*. In any case, Cluny and the family of Raymond of Burgundy, the count of Galicia, ought to lead scholars to the Holy Roman Empire. That path deserves to be pursued, given the imperial pretensions of the Leonese kings, Compostela’s tussles with eleventh-century popes, the traces of Ottonian art in northern Spanish metalwork, ivories, and manuscripts, and the imperial and cosmopolitan agenda that fueled the Charlemagne legends elsewhere in Europe—as recently argued by Anne Latowsky (*Emperor of the World: Charlemagne and the Construction of Imperial Authority, 800–1229*, 2013).

With such caveats, Galicia’s artistic exchanges with what we call France demand revision. Reconsidering the concepts of the ‘pilgrimage church’ and

the 'architecture of the pilgrimage roads'; Henrik Karge reassesses the closely related churches at Tours, Limoges, Conques, Toulouse, and Compostela which share ambulatories with radiating chapels, ample transepts, aisled interiors, and galleries. Crucially, this design preceded the Romanesque project at Compostela and was ignored at celebrated sites in *The Pilgrim's Guide*. Therefore, as Karge says, it "makes no sense to tie it conceptually to the apostolic shrine or the pilgrimage routes." Instead, the innovative formula arose from "keen competition" among shrines in Aquitaine, and it artfully mixed the "earlier Frankish tradition of enshrining relics above ground" with reminiscences of the ring crypt and confessio of Old St. Peter's in Rome.

One crucial prototype for the architecture at Compostela was the abbey church of Sainte-Foy de Conques, whose monks energetically promoted their shrine in the eleventh century with texts publicizing the saint's miracles, dramatizing her martyrdom and its aftermath, and spreading the marvelous tale of her relics. Manuel Castiñeiras lays out the importance of Conques as well for the style, subjects, and format of early sculpture at Santiago, and he details the abbey's intimate connections with Navarre and Aragón—regions with their own artistic ties to Compostela—through Bishop Pedro de Rodez of Pamplona, a former monk of Conques.

Students of Romanesque art will be well acquainted with attempts to 'reconstruct' the original appearance of the south transept façade (Puerta de Platerías) of the cathedral, that "palimpsest in stone" which, as Castiñeiras recalls, Henri Focillon likened to the walls of a lapidary museum. Castiñeiras amplifies the framework for the portal's many remodelings by downplaying the repairs occasioned by the uprising of 1117 and bringing to light forgotten medieval alterations. Most intriguingly, he imaginatively retraces the debates and decisions that shaped the evolving design of both transept portals during their construction by "an international workshop" featuring skilled sculptors familiar with other major projects. With this, the transept façades are restored to us as sites of daring experimentation and ingenious improvisation, rather than jumbles of errors and makeshift repairs, constrained by contingencies and dwindling resources.

Isolating each step in such a process must always be a speculative venture, but the salutary effort helps redefine Compostela's mark on twelfth-century art. It was never a mere receptacle for the ready-made formulas of foreign artists: instead, the shrine's power to summon talent from far and wide made it a prolific laboratory for innovative ideas that might be fully realized at far-off sites. Beyond the simple recurrence of figures or motifs at Compostela and the Porte Miègeville in Toulouse or the Romanesque basilicas of León and Jaca, Conques illustrates this more creative and consequential impact of Compostela.

The diverse artists who assembled at Compostela around 1100 were charged with designing an integrated set of sculpted façades of an unprecedented scale and complexity. This novel challenge may, in turn, have borne fruit in the huge tympanum of the Last Judgment at Conques—now widely dated to the early twelfth century—as a result of its makers' trials at Compostela. Ultimately, the Compostelan achievement sowed the seeds, as Karge suggests, for the Gothic façades of the Île-de-France with their triple portals and encyclopedic array of sacred and secular subjects.

This understanding of how Compostela relied on foreign talent to become, in turn, a catalyst for artistic developments inspires Rocío Sánchez's apt characterization of the style of Master Mateo as a "visual polyglossy," shaped by the concourse of artists, expert in different media, who made late twelfth-century Compostela one of the most dynamic and cosmopolitan artistic centers of its day. While Mateo's Pórtico has won due praise from art historians, its late date and distant location long isolated it from what scholars deemed the formative currents of both Romanesque and Gothic. As stylistic labels and evolutionary models have relaxed their grip on art history, we may better appreciate that the Pórtico and its artistic milieu mirrored the Compostelan experience of the early twelfth century. Here, artists of diverse backgrounds came together for a work that paid homage to earlier achievements while embarking upon the most 'modern' experiments, as Sánchez contends, with color, light, pierced architecture, and sculptured spaces, anticipating the integrated aesthetic vision of the great Gothic cathedrals of the next generations.

While the status of Santiago Cathedral as a twelfth-century monument is widely accepted, Compostela seldom enters studies of medieval learning. On the contrary, the dearth of Latin narrative or religious texts from western Iberia, the adherence to the liturgy, script, and language of earlier ages, and the belated reception of Carolingian culture have perpetuated a dim view of the level of education in the region in the early and central Middle Ages. Even in twelfth-century Galicia, the numerous monasteries of the Cistercians have been dubbed "bibliographic wastelands," due to the disappearance or dispersal of their libraries, as Ana Suárez observes. Nonetheless, we have already seen the ubiquity and erudition of written records in early medieval Galicia. In the twelfth century, the massive *Historia Compostellana*—the account of the deeds of Archbishop Diego Gelmírez introduced in the last section by its editor and translator, Emma Falque—was hardly composed *ex nihilo*. Castiñeiras and Sánchez demonstrate that the art of Compostela expressed wide-ranging theological reflection and intellectual acumen. Similarly, Karge makes plain that the cathedral's architecture "stands out for the clarity and precision of its system of proportions, right down to the basic units of measurement."

Adeline Rucquoi disentangles this paradox by presenting the art of Compostela and the dossier of texts promoting the apostle's cult as the accomplishments of a talented and multifaceted cathedral school, deeply rooted in the widespread learning of early medieval Galicia and internationalized by the gathering together of scholars and texts in the age of the pilgrimage. She marshals extensive evidence from early medieval charters for schools, students, teachers, books, and literacy across Galicia, and for centers of higher learning at monasteries, cathedrals, and the royal court. Arguing that Galicians obeyed the educational mandates of Visigothic councils and those of the mid-eleventh century, she concludes that Compostela, above all, "was destined to become the educational center of the region, and the great achievement of its school was to be the promotion of the apostolic see and shrine." Princes and prelates were educated there, foreign masters and students arrived in the age of the pilgrimage, and the school garnered a rich and diverse library whose contents may be divined from the widely varied products of the school and the range of citations within them.

The school's importance has escaped attention partly because what Rucquoi terms its "multiform oeuvre—chronicles, histories, preambles of charters, hagiography, epic narratives, buildings, art works, music, and forged diplomas"—was dedicated single-mindedly to the exaltation of the Compostelan see and apostolic cult and, secondarily, to the interests of Galicia. As that cause lost its luster, these works languished in contrast with the legacy of schools of law, theology, medicine, mathematics, or astronomy. Such subjects, however, were not neglected at Compostela, as Rucquoi demonstrates by combing the literature of the cult, the art of the cathedral, and a scattering of other Compostelan works which she deftly identifies and assembles. Rucquoi's vision of the school's Compostelan agenda invites a comparison between the contribution of foreign masters and that of foreign artists at work on the cathedral: through their collaboration and expertise, these scholars advanced a uniquely Compostelan goal and created, among other things, the highly original ensemble in the *Liber sancti Jacobi*, including its sermons and miracle tales, the polyphony of its hymns, *The Pilgrim's Guide*, and the chronicle of the pseudo-Turpin (*Historia Turpini*). Indeed, touting the role of foreigners and far-flung sources in works like the *Liber sancti Jacobi* became an integral part of the program of a school keen to proclaim the universality of the apostolic cult and pilgrimage.

Rucquoi sees signs of a "high level of learning across Galicia" in the late twelfth century, and Rocío Sánchez's exposition of the sculpture of the cathedrals of Ourense and Tui supports this. One might imagine that the Cistercians, like earlier monks, also enriched written culture in Galicia, at least in liturgy,

spirituality, and record-keeping. After all, Cistercian statutes specify, as Ana Suárez points out, “the numbers and types of books deemed essential for... every new community.” In Galicia, the order founded or reformed at least ten houses in the two generations after monks from Clairvaux arrived at Sobrado in 1142, and one charter of that house describes a knight’s cession of property in 1177 in return for a liturgical book—presumably prepared at Sobrado—for his church (*pro uno libro breuiario de totius anni circulo obtimo apreciatum in solidos. c[entum].*, AHN Clero, 530/8). Nonetheless, the libraries of these monasteries were already dismissed in the sixteenth century by Ambrosio de Morales as poor and of scant interest, and modern scholars have let his judgment stand.

Ana Suárez begins to recover their largely lost or unrecognized bibliographic patrimony by locating books that have traveled, analyzing charters to disclose the “human resources” for scriptoria, and dissecting their known books, the *Tumbos* of Sobrado. These tomes have typically been viewed as a pair of cartularies of the mid-thirteenth century, but Suárez exposes “their artificial assemblage and their complex stratigraphy,” revealing them to be a “diplomatic library” of “about twenty codicological units...perfectly distinguishable by their external and internal features.” Beyond the precious evidence the codices yield for the scriptorium and library of Sobrado (complemented by the author’s discovery of a *carmen figuratum* attributed to Venantius Fortunatus), Suárez’s painstaking analysis offers invaluable insights into the whole process of making, keeping, organizing, and using the written records of a medieval monastery with a vast and dispersed domain.

Most cultural exchanges cited in these articles are tangible ones: the movements of artists and scholars, or of manuscripts, enamels, and reliquaries; and the establishment of religious houses. There is, however, another side to the cosmopolitanism of medieval Compostela—and Galicia: the aspirations of the Compostelan clergy to vie with the famed sanctuaries of Rome and the Holy Land, and the cultural anxieties of a region understood to lie at the edge of the earth. To a degree, specific ties to these sites helped satisfy these ambitions: Karge, for example, sees the imprint of Old St. Peter’s on the choir design of the so-called pilgrimage churches; Castiñeiras notes the exchanges of books with Rome and the imitation of the spiraling marble columns there; and Rocío Sánchez discerns landmarks of Jerusalem in the imagery of the portal of Tui Cathedral.

In the age of the crusades and of renewed interest in the culture of ancient Rome and of the primitive church, such impulses were hardly unique to Compostela, but the cult of a leading apostle martyred in Jerusalem, the success of the long-distance pilgrimage, and the extension of the crusading

ideology to the Iberian Peninsula all combined to fashion this emulation and rivalry into a coherent program that dwarfed and appropriated efforts elsewhere. As the Romanesque basilica hid the original shrine from view, images eclipsed relics and the unmatched comprehensiveness of that imagery enhanced the apostle's cult with allusions to the Holy Land, Rome, and key shrines throughout Christendom. The arduous challenge of the long-distance pilgrimage overshadowed any deficiencies in the destination's tenuous attachment—by comparison with Rome or the Holy Land—to biblical history or the days of the early church. Texts in the *Liber sancti Jacobi* charted, celebrated, moralized, and sanctified the road, with its perils and rewards, and the architecture and imagery of the cathedral recapitulated the pilgrim's physical and spiritual journey, culminating, as Castiñeiras and Sánchez explain, in the brilliant vision of the New Jerusalem in the Pórtico da Gloria. Indeed, Castiñeiras's title, "The Topography of Images," is particularly felicitous because the architecture and imagery of the cathedral are imbued throughout, as in few other buildings, with the pilgrim's experience and metaphors of the journey.

Within this volume, the concentration of four articles on the cathedral invites us to linger here for a moment on the significance of one deceptively simple issue that surfaces several times: the chronology of the building. Santiago Cathedral poses a scholarly puzzle: for a church of its era, it is uncommonly well documented by contemporary texts and inscriptions, yet its dates spark furious debates. Sometimes fueled by outmoded obsessions with originality and influence, these controversies nonetheless have consequences for our understanding of the Galician culture to which the building belongs.

There is general agreement about the importance, if not the meaning, of well-attested signposts in the cathedral's history: its commencement c. 1075, the completion of at least most of the church by the early 1120s, Master Mateo's contract of 1168, the setting of the great lintel of the Pórtico da Gloria in 1188, and the consecration in 1211. An enterprise of this scale demands complicated planning and preparation on many fronts. We may never determine a precise starting date, partly because we may never decide what exactly it means to 'begin' such a project. Here and in other studies, Karge and Castiñeiras stress, in different ways, how much was envisioned from the outset and achieved by 1100, and how much of this already involved a breadth of artistic exchanges. This enlarges the role of Bishop Diego Peláez (1071–1088) and the cathedral chapter, and it pushes the conception of this ambitious undertaking even further back, possibly to the time of King García of Galicia (1065–1071) who likely named the prelate.

This revaluation of the first quarter century of the cathedral's construction has implications that reach backwards and forwards. The mid-eleventh

century was an expansive moment for the Compostelan school with a quickening of long-distance cultural contacts and local steps, like the Compostelan councils of c. 1060, for religious reform. Under García's rule, the brief independence of the kingdom of Galicia supplied opportunity and motivation for a larger cultural project. There are continuities—bound up with the political events traced by Ermelindo Portela in the last section and the cultural politics described here by Rucquoi—between the artistic programs conceived under King García in the 1060s and Count Raymond in the 1090s. With this, the specifically Galician agenda behind the cathedral's conception must be kept in sight.

The accomplishments of the late eleventh century diminish those of some figures or institutions traditionally associated with the great building: King Alfonso VI, the abbey of Cluny, and, most of all, Bishop Diego Gelmírez (1100–1140). True, Gelmírez likely became involved with the project in the 1090s, when he administered the vacant see for several years and served as notary and chancellor to Raymond of Burgundy, count of Galicia. Nonetheless, Karge points out that Gelmírez's own *Historia Compostellana* hardly trumpets his efforts as builder, while *The Pilgrim's Guide* leaps over more recent activity to memorialize the first builders, the late eleventh-century canons overseeing the works, and even the deposed bishop Diego Peláez.

That Gelmírez inherited a well-advanced building campaign for a project drawn up over two decades earlier does not negate his imprint, particularly on the sculpted façades of the transepts. Castiñeiras has analyzed several ways in which their realization and reception were conditioned by the prelate's travels, his evolving ties with the papacy, his lordship over the town, and his tutelage of the future King Alfonso VII. Of course, one may debate the extent to which some of these facets of the programs bear Gelmírez's personal stamp or represent institutional continuities as the Compostelan bishops and clergy defined their relationships with the papacy, the monarchy, and the town.

Chipping away at the protagonism of Diego Gelmírez reminds us of how much our understanding of Compostela and of the Leonese church depends upon the sheer weight of the *Historia Compostellana* in a landscape devoid of such narratives. In the last section, Emma Falque reeled off a staggering list of topics about which “we would know little” without that source. True, the writing of this work is itself a historical fact that says much about the ambitions and achievements of Gelmírez and the early twelfth-century see. Nonetheless, Compostela's aspirations and the more complex tale of the place of Galicia and the Leonese kingdom amidst the ecclesiastical reforms of the central Middle Ages did not begin or end with Gelmírez, and should not be seen only through the skewed lense of his laudatory history.

In one way, however, recent scholarship has magnified Gelmírez's part in the cathedral's construction. There is a growing consensus, to which Karge subscribes and Rocío Sánchez refers, that the building was completed under his tenure, and that Mateo's Pórtico represents a thorough renovation of an earlier west façade, not the delayed end to an unfinished church. In the 1970s and the 1980s, the pendulum had swung from Kenneth Conant's view of an early completion (*The Early Architectural History of the Cathedral of Santiago de Compostela*, 1926) to the arguments of Michael Ward, Serafín Moralejo, and myself that large parts of the western bays of the nave were only erected after the mid-twelfth century in the campaign crowned by Mateo's work. Over the last fifteen years, Christabel Watson, Bernd Nicolai, Klaus Rheidt, Jens Ruffer, Anke Wunderwald, and others have resuscitated Conant's original position with new arguments.

Interested readers can follow our authors' references to relevant bibliography, but the main points in favor of the cathedral's early completion are these. First, details of the western towers, their faulty alignment in relation to the axes of the building, and their irregular attachment to the nave establish that they were laid out near the start of the project and raised to a considerable height in the early campaigns. Second, *The Pilgrim's Guide* describes a sculpted west façade, if only in summary. Third, the western fabric bears numerous scars of adjustments and alterations to fit Mateo's triple portal within a façade originally prepared for two doorways like those of the transepts. Finally, these writers contend that masons' marks and capitals in the western bays—key to counterarguments for a late date—either cannot be dated conclusively or may be additions to an existing fabric.

The two contrasting positions are not irreconcilable. A western block was planned from the beginning, as the description in *The Pilgrim's Guide*—whether of work realized or envisioned—makes plain. Construction of the foundations and towers was launched very early on the sharply sloping terrain at the west. Mateo's Pórtico was 'inserted' into an earlier closing wall, but that 'relative chronology' begs some vital questions: how much of the planned decoration of that façade was in place? how much of the enclosed area within the western wall had been fully built up? was that closing wall raised a generation earlier, or did Mateo's Pórtico represent a change of design—a pentimento on the grandest scale—within the first years of the last campaign? While the masonry breaks and alterations that expose chronological sequences are visible at a glance, architectural sculpture requires thorough and detailed comparative analysis of a large body of scattered evidence to turn relative sequences into absolute chronologies. It should not be dismissed simply because the effort entails more than scrutiny of a wall or groundplan. The process of

experimentation and revision which Castiñeiras describes here for the transept portals around 1100 helps us imagine what, in my view, happened sixty years later when the effort to complete the west end of the cathedral saw a radical change—during construction—from the double doorway of earlier plans to Mateo's splendid Pórtico.

This extended reflection on Mateo's campaign is warranted because it gets to the heart of Compostela's distinctive character as a cosmopolitan artistic center. Santiago Cathedral was not the product of a local school of architects, sculptors, and masons, like those of Burgundy or Emilia, developing, reproducing, and refining basic patterns from one project to another in an ongoing dialogue among nearby sites. Compostela's gathering of foreign artists made it a place of invention and sudden change, more than one of reception and gradual evolution. In its architectural design, sculptural style, religious meanings, and liturgical functions, Mateo's Westwerk was just such an original creation. It would be wholly consistent with this to imagine it—like the evolving forms of the transept portals—as a design only finalized and agreed upon after the project to complete the west façade was well underway, and the talent for its realization already assembled.

Whatever did or did not exist at the west end of the cathedral before the Pórtico, and whatever the methodological implications of this debate for historians of art and architecture, one thing is clear: Master Mateo—or the artists behind that name—created a wholly new and integrated ensemble that attests to the high level of Compostelan culture in the late twelfth century and, as Rocío Sánchez argues, to the importance of Compostela's ties with the monarchy under the Leonese kings, Fernando II and Alfonso IX, who made it their royal pantheon. The artistic and intellectual sophistication and complexity of the Pórtico, amply expounded here by Sánchez and Castiñeiras, show, among other things, how the *Historia Compostellana* has distorted our understanding of Compostela. As Roger Wright observes later in this volume, the Paris-educated archbishop Pedro Suárez de Deza (1173–1206) “would probably be now as widely celebrated as Diego Gelmírez, if he had only had a biographer.”

The learned prelate left us no memoir, but the Pórtico speaks eloquently of the wide artistic horizons, profound erudition, and cosmopolitan achievements of Compostela under his rule. Nor was this an isolated work. Rocío Sánchez's discussion of the cathedrals of Ourense and Tui, Ana Suárez's survey of Cistercian scriptoria, Adeline Rucquoi's conclusions about the Compostelan school, and the intensive Romanesque construction across the region that I highlighted in my introduction all point to the artistic, cultural, religious, and intellectual ascendancy of Galicia during the period (1157–1230) when it once again recovered its weight within a kingdom, the Leonese realm of Fernando II

and Alfonso IX. Then, as Sánchez explains, Compostela forged a close alliance with the monarchy and aspired to be a royal city. Indeed, one larger outcome of these studies might be to replace, complement, or balance the traditional roles of Alfonso VI, Cluny, the Gregorian reformers, and Pope Calixtus II in the history of Compostela and Galicia with those of Fernando II, the Cistercians, Pope Alexander III, and the legate Cardinal Hyacinth—the future Pope Celestine III.

In the previous section, Francisco J. Pérez Rodríguez challenged the topos of Galicia's decline and marginalization in the thirteenth-century kingdom of Castile-León, and he demonstrated the continuities between the policies of Fernando III and Alfonso X, and those of their Leonese predecessors. Here, our authors show that the *Historia Compostellana* offers but one segment of a longer history of artistic, cultural, and religious achievement, centered on Compostela and the cult of St. James, but encompassing the entire region. It had roots in the earlier religious culture of Galicia and, arguably, it would crest in the age of Mateo under the Leonese kings. Moreover, Galician culture would flourish in the thirteenth century as well. Melissa Katz's study of Queen Violante's foundation of the Clarissan convent at Allariz gives us a glimpse of Galicia's continuing attraction for members of the royal family and the entry of the mendicants into the region. Moreover, her discussion of the bitter conflicts between the Franciscans and Bishop Pedro Eanes de Novoa of Ourense is but a taste of the religious and cultural politics of some of the protagonists—the episcopacy, noble lineages, the religious orders, townspeople, and the crown—whose activities Pérez Rodríguez cited as evidence of the vigor of the region and its importance to the monarchy throughout the thirteenth century and beyond. Of course, the most lasting evidence of the vitality of thirteenth-century Galician culture would be the introduction of vernacular writing and the flowering of Galician-Portuguese lyrics, the subjects of part 6.